Counteracting Stereotype Threat
Research-Based Tools and Tactics

Catherine Good, Ph.D.
Baruch College, CUNY

Support for this work was provided by the National Science Foundation's Research on Gender in Science and Engineering under award HRD-1203164. Any opinions, findings, and conclusions or recommendations expressed in this material are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views of the National Science Foundation.
EIT Project Team

Diane Matt, M.S.
PI & Women in Engineering ProActive Network (WEPAN) Executive Director

Susan Metz, Ph.D.
Co-PI & Director of Diversity and Inclusion, Stevens Institute of Technology

Gretal Leibnitz, Ph.D.
Co-PI & EIT Project Director
EIT Project Goal & Strategies

To create engineering learning environments that support the persistence and success of all students, especially diverse women and minority men, by:

- Distilling key social-science research findings
- Sharing practical teaching advice
- Delivering convenient live/recorded webinars
- Providing easy-adoption checklists/resources
Catherine Good, Ph.D.

Catherine Good, Ph.D. is an associate professor of psychology at Baruch College of the City University of New York and a member of the graduate faculty at CUNY’s Graduate Center. She earned a M.S. in mathematics (University of Kansas) and an Ad Hoc Interdisciplinary PhD in mathematics education and social psychology (The University of Texas at Austin.) Dr. Good’s research program focuses on the social factors that impact students’ academic achievement, learning, motivation, and self-image. She also develops interventions for students, teachers, and parents to facilitate the development of effective and engaged learners. Her work has received national attention as well as funding from the National Science Foundation, U.S. Department of Education, and National Institutes of Health.
“In the perception of society my athletic talents are genetic; I am a likely mugger-rapist; my academic failures are expected; and my academic successes are attributed to others. To spend most of my life fighting these attitudes levies an emotional tax that is a form of intellectual emasculation.”

-Dr. Neil de Grasse Tyson

One reason for the lack of women at the highest professions in STEM is because of “…different availability of aptitude at the high end.”

-Dr. Larry Summers
Stereotype Threat

Unpleasant apprehension arising from the awareness of a negative ability stereotype in a situation where the stereotype is relevant, and thus confirmable.

(Steele & Aronson, 1995)
Stereotype Threat Undermines Calculus Performance

Good, Aronson, & Harder, 2008
Stereotype Threat Undermines Learning

Percent of errors corrected after learning opportunity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Male</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Non-threat</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stereotype Threat</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Good, Mangels, & Evelo, 2015
How Can Stereotype Threat be Reduced?

• Encourage Growth Mindsets
• Encourage Belonging Based on Effort/Engagement
• Re-attributions for Difficulty
Growth Mindsets (Dweck, 1999)

**Entity Theorists**

Intelligence is fixed
- Trait largely determined by nature

**Incremental Theorists**

Intelligence is malleable
- Quality that can be increased through nurture

Desire similar outcome
- achieving good scores, doing “well”

Different motivation for pursuing this outcome

**Performance goals**

“The main thing I want when I do my school work is to show how good I am at it.”

**Learning goals**

“In school I am always seeking opportunities to develop new skills and acquire new knowledge.”
Mindsets That Reduce Stereotype Threat

Good, Aronson, & Inzlicht, 2003
Teachers’ Theories of Intelligence Impact Pedagogical Practices

Teachers who hold an incremental theory of math intelligence, endorse teaching practices that

- Convey intelligence as malleable (e.g., focus on strategies for outcomes)
- Emphasize the role of effort in outcomes
- Increase opportunities to work on challenging problems

Provide him with challenging math tasks.

Rattan, Good, & Dweck, 2012
Belonging to The Stereotyped Domain

Sense of Belonging:

• Feeling like an accepted member of the academic domain whose presence and participation is valued by peers and instructors
The Role of Sense of Belonging

Negative Perceptions of Environment → Sense Of Belonging → Math Grades

Intent to take Math in the Future

$\chi^2 (20) = 46.82, \ p < .001, \ CFI = .84, \ NFI = .77, \ RMSEA < .004, \ Pclose = .95$

Good, Rattan, & Dweck, 2012
The students who put in effort are the ones who truly belong in math.

Students who passed the class with very little effort were less accepted by the math teachers than those who put a lot of work into the class.
Effort-Based Sense of Belonging Protects Learning from Stereotype Threat

Percent of Errors Corrected After Learning Opportunity

Non-threat  Stereotype Threat

Female  Male

Engineering Inclusive Teaching
Faculty Professional Development
POWERED BY WEFNN
Reattribution for Difficulty
Attributing Difficulties to Non-Stable Causes

- Struggles that you experience now will get better over time.
- Students like you have struggled in similar ways in the past, but have eventually overcome those difficulties.
Attributing Difficulties to External Causes

Johns, Schmader, & Martens, 2005
Research-based Strategies for Reducing Stereotype Threat

- Encourage students and teachers to adopt a growth mindset.
- Encourage students to base their feelings of belonging on their efforts and engagement.
- Create a classroom learning environment that values effort and engagement as a path to belonging.
- Encourage students to attribute their difficulties to causes other than their own limitations.
Discussion Questions

1. How can you create a classroom environment that fosters growth mindsets?
2. How can you create a classroom environment that creates room for many more people to feel a sense of belonging to STEM?
3. How can you help students re-attribute their difficulties to non-stable factors?
Mindsets That Reduce Stereotype Threat

**Entity** messages reduce *Sense of Belonging*, which negatively affects achievement and retention in the domain

- especially in the face of stereotypes.

**Incremental** messages help maintain high *Sense of Belonging* which positively affects achievement and interest in the domain

- even in the presence of negative stereotypes.
Mindsets that Reduce Stereotype Threat
(Continued)

Educators who emphasize effort (rather than ability) as a key determinant in students’ belongingness in academics may:

- promote more learning engagement for underrepresented students
- reduce stereotype threat
- perhaps help eliminate the culture of “talent”.

Over time, higher engagement could eventually lead to higher learning and achievement.
Attributions that Reduce Stereotype Threat

Difficulties are a result of:
  • test anxiety, or
  • the stereotype threat process

Everyone struggles at some point and most eventually overcome their difficulties
Thank You

Katharine Atterbury  Ayesha Ferdouse
Anna Bennet       Matthew Fong
Christine Boodie  Maryam Gooyabodi
Renee Cotsis     Sebastian Lema
Laura Deering    Jennifer Mangels
Carol Dweck      Aneeta Rattan
Andrew Evelo    Ramyaa Ravichandra

www.ReducingStereotypeThreat.org

This work was funded in part by the National Science Foundation,Grant # GSE 0936769 and # BCS-02-I7251
Next Steps

✓ Download the PDF presentation
✓ Review Dr. Good’s prior NAPE webinar
✓ Look for updates: Reducing Stereotype Threat
✓ Go to the EIT website: www.WSKC.org/EIT
  • Sign up to participate in future live webinars
    • Register: Active Learning—’Live and Online’ (April 9, 2015)
    • Drs. Richard Felder & Rebecca Brent—Master Educators
  • Listen to previously recorded webinars
  • Use the Action Checklists & Other Resources
  • Apply for the Inclusive Educator Award! (May 1st deadline)
✓ Share this information with colleagues!
✓ Provide us feedback!
  • Receive personalized “Certificate of Participation” upon completion!
Personalized “To Do”

Based on what you have learned, what are YOUR next steps to creating an inclusive learning context for your students?
National Alliance for Partnerships in Equity

Co-sponsor of WEPAN EIT Webinar Series

Professional Development
Custom Webinars
Annual Conference
Equity Implementation Toolkits
Consulting Services
Research & Public Policy

The nation’s leading professional alliance for access, equity, and diversity in education, training, and careers.

NAPEquity.org
Together we can engage all minds in engineering the future!

Gretal Leibnitz, Ph.D.,
EIT Co-PI & Project Director
Leibnitz@WEPAN.org